

# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE United States Patent and Trademark Office Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS P.O. Box 1450 Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450 www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO	).	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.	
10/006,368	10/006,368 12/10/2001		Ronald Hoogendoom	P 0284116 50800/US	1673	
909	7590	06/29/2004	EXAMINER		INER	
		THROP, LLP	HAMLIN, D	HAMLIN, DERRICK G		
P.O. BOX 10500 MCLEAN, VA 22102				ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER	
				1751		
				DATE MAIL ED. 06/20/200	DATE MAIL ED: 06/20/2004	

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

	Application No.	Applicant(s)					
	10/006,368	HOOGENDOORN ET AL.					
Office Action Summary	Examiner	Art Unit					
	Derrick G. Hamlin	1751					
The MAILING DATE of this communication app Period for Reply	pears on the cover sheet with the c	orrespondence address					
A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPL' THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION.  - Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.1 after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication.  - If the period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply if NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period versions to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).	36(a). In no event, however, may a reply be ting within the statutory minimum of thirty (30) day will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from , cause the application to become ABANDONE	nely filed /s will be considered timely. In the mailing date of this communication. ED (35 U.S.C. § 133).					
Status							
1) Responsive to communication(s) filed on 10 D	ecember 2001.						
,— .	action is non-final.						
3) Since this application is in condition for allowa							
closed in accordance with the practice under E	closed in accordance with the practice under Ex parte Quayle, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.						
Disposition of Claims							
4) Claim(s) <u>1-5</u> is/are pending in the application.							
4a) Of the above claim(s) is/are withdra	wn from consideration.						
5) Claim(s) is/are allowed.							
6)⊠ Claim(s) <u>1,2,4 and 5</u> is/are rejected.	Claim(s) <u>1,2,4 and 5</u> is/are rejected.						
7)⊠ Claim(s) <u>3</u> is/are objected to.	Claim(s) 3 is/are objected to.						
8) Claim(s) are subject to restriction and/o	Claim(s) are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.						
Application Papers							
9)☐ The specification is objected to by the Examiner.							
10) The drawing(s) filed on is/are: a) acc	☐ The drawing(s) filed on is/are: a)☐ accepted or b)☐ objected to by the Examiner.						
Applicant may not request that any objection to the	Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).						
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correct	Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).						
11) The oath or declaration is objected to by the Ex	☐ The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.						
Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119							
<ul> <li>12)  Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).</li> <li>a)  All b)  Some * c) None of:</li> <li>1. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.</li> <li>2. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No</li> <li>3. Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).</li> <li>* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.</li> </ul>							
Attachment(s)	_						
1) Notice of References Cited (PTO-892)  4) Interview Summary (PTO-413)  2) Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)  Paper No(s)/Mail Date							
<ol> <li>Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)</li> <li>Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO-1449 or PTO/SB/08) Paper No(s)/Mail Date <u>12/01</u>.</li> </ol>		Patent Application (PTO-152)					

## **DETAILED ACTION**

# Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 102

The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless -

(b) the invention was patented or described in a printed publication in this or a foreign country or in public use or on sale in this country, more than one year prior to the date of application for patent in the United States.

Evaluations of level of ordinary skill in the art requires consideration of factors such as various prior art approaches employed, types of problems encountered in the art, rapidity with which innovations are made, sophistication of technology involved, educational background of those actively working in the field, commercial success, failure of others, and the inventor's educational level.

The "person having ordinary skill" in this art has the capability of understanding the scientific and engineering principles applicable to the claimed invention. The references of record in this case reasonably reflect this level of skill.

Claims 1, 2, 4 and 5 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being anticipated by EP 0688854.

EP 0688854 discloses the following structure in page 9, lines 1-14:

Page 3

Application/Control Number: 10/006,368

Art Unit: 1751

10

#### EP 0 688 854 A1

(examples of complex esters containing 4 or more ester linkages in the molecule).

In the above general formulas,  $R_1$  is H or an alkyl group having 1 to 3 carbon atoms,  $R_2$  is a straight or branched-chain alkyl group having 5 to 12 carbon atoms,  $R_3$  is an alkyl group having 1 to 3 carbon atoms,  $R_3$  is an alkyl group having 1 to 3 carbon atoms, and n is an integer of 0 to 5.

EP 0688854 further teaches that the method by which the compounds are made in page 9, lines 19-28:

As the complex esters represented by the general formula (5), esters having a high viscosity and a wide critical solution temperature range can be obtained by selecting the chemical structure of the central dibasic acid (dicarboxylic acid) component from various chemical structures derived from succinic acid (n = 2), glutaric acid (abbreviated as Glut), adipic acid (abbreviated as AZP), pimelic acid, suberic acid, azelaic acid, and sebacic acid (n = 8), selecting the polyhydric alcohol component and the terminal monocarboxylic acid component from various compounds, and varying the blending proportions (molar fraction).

The monocarboxylic acids represented by the formula  $R_2COOH$  may be straight- or branched-chain ones. The latter includes 2-ethylhexanoic acid (2EH), 2-methylhexanoic acid (i-C<sub>7</sub>), 3,5.5-trimethylhexanoic acid, 3.5-dimethylhexanoic acid (i-C<sub>8</sub>), 2-methylheptanoic acid. The monocarboxylic acids may be used singly or in combination of two or more thereof.

The reference is anticipatory.

In view of the forgoing, the above claims have failed to be patently distinguishable over prior art.

The remaining references listed on form(s) 892 and/or 1449 have been reviewed by the examiner and are considered to be cumulative to or less material than the prior art references relied upon in the rejection above.

Application/Control Number: 10/006,368

Art Unit: 1751

## Allowable Subject Matter

Claim 3 is objected to as being dependent upon a rejected base claim, but would be allowable if rewritten in independent form including all of the limitations of the base claim and any intervening claims.

None of the cited prior art references discloses the claimed compound where y is branched with 4-6 carbons and n=1.5-5

## Conclusion

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Derrick G. Hamlin whose telephone number is (571) 272-1317. The examiner can normally be reached on Monday-Fridays from ~8:30 AM to 5:00 PM.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Dr. Yogendra Gupta, can be reached on (571) 272-1316. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 703-872-9306.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see http://pair-direct.uspto.gov. Should

Application/Control Number: 10/006,368

Art Unit: 1751

you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic

Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

Derrick G. Hamlin

6/22/04

YOGENDRA N. GUPTA SUPERVISORY PATENT EXAMINER Page 5

TECHNOLOGY CENTER 1700